



Erasmus+
Jean Monnet Centre of Excellence
St. Petersburg State University, Russia



Санкт-Петербург 2016
Записка №14

Татьяна Романова

Энергетическое сотрудничество России и Евросоюза в зарубежной литературе

Отношения России и Евросоюза в энергетике привлекали рекордное количество исследователей за рубежом, в сравнении с изучением других сфера сотрудничества России и ЕС. Это обусловлено, главным образом, тем, что в данной сфере Евросоюз особенно чувствует свою уязвимость в диалоге с Россией. Если в вопросах экономического сотрудничества и визовой политике мяч, скорее, на стороне Брюсселя, который использует свои конкурентные преимущества для давления на Россию, то в энергетике все воспринимается наоборот. В этой связи закономерным стал и фокус на природном газе как основном «болевым» аспекте, поскольку в данной сфере Россия и ЕС инфраструктурно связаны, а диверсификация поставок осложнена. В то же время крупные объемы поставок нефти, нефтепродуктов и ядерных материалов из России в ЕС вопросов не вызывали, поскольку переключение на альтернативных поставщиков здесь менее проблематично, а соответствующие рынки глобальны.

Если в российских исследованиях энергетических связей доминировала эмпирика, то в Евросоюзе его доля была значительно ниже, а энергетические отношения с Россией использовались для построения или тестирования различных теорий. Прежде всего, надо отметить использование концепций зависимости, взаимной зависимости, международного

общества и комплексов безопасности.¹ Кроме того, в исследованиях энергетических связей России и Евросоюза прочно обосновался термин «геополитика».²

Постепенно выкристаллизировались две традиции, два контрастирующих подхода к отношениям России и Евросоюза в энергетике. Первый, основанный на рыночной экономике и институтах, отталкивался от либеральной традиции международных отношений, призывал к выстраиванию между Россией и Евросоюзом отношений, основанных на рынке и праве.³ В связи с этим можно также отметить и исследование роли Договора к Энергетической хартии, а также роли Евросоюза по экстернализации своего законодательства.⁴ К этой же традиции надо отнести исследования сближения

¹ Casier, T. 1) Russia's Energy Leverage over the EU: Myth or Reality? // Perspectives on European Politics and Society. 2011. Vol. 12. No 4; 2) The Rise of Energy to the Top of the EU-Russia Agenda: From Interdependence to Dependence? // Geopolitics. 2011. Vol. 16. No. 3; Esakova, N. European energy security: analysing the EU-Russia energy security regime in terms of interdependence theory. Wiesbaden: Springer, 2012; Gromadzki, G. Between Need and Dependency. Russian Gas in the Energy Balance of the Enlarged EU. Warsaw, December 2002. On the Future of Europe. Policy Paper. No 8; Harsem, Ø., Claes, D.H. The interdependence of European–Russian energy relations // Energy Policy. 2013. Vol. 59. August; Kirchner, E., Berk, C. European Energy Security Co-operation: Between Amity and Enmity // Journal of Common Market Studies. 2010. Vol. 48. No.4; ; Khrushcheva, O. The Creation of an Energy Security Society as a Way to Decrease Securitization Levels between the European Union and Russia in Energy Trade // Journal of Contemporary European Research. 2011. Vol. 7. No 2; Moraski, B., Giurcanu, M. European Reactions to the 2008 Georgian–Russian War: Assessing the Impact of Gas Dependence // Studies in Comparative International Development. 2013. Vol. 48. No 4; Morgado Dos Santos, A.M. How to Rebalance the EU-Russia Relationship: Potential and Limits // European Foreign Affairs Review. 2010, Vol. 15. No 3; Padgett, S. Energy Co-operation in the Wider Europe: Institutionalizing Interdependence // Journal of Common Market Studies. 2011. Vol. 49. No 5; Paillard, C.-A. Russia And Europe's Mutual Energy Dependence // Journal of International Affairs. 2010. Spring/Summer. Vol. 63. No 2; Proedrou, F. The EU–Russia Energy Approach under the Prism of Interdependence // European Security. 2007. Vol. 16. No 3-4; Sánchez Andrés, A. Russia and Europe: Mutual Dependence in the Energy Sector. Madrid: Real Instituto Elcano, 2007. Working Paper. No 25.

² Bosse, G., Schmidt-Felzmann, A. The Geopolitics of Energy Supply in the 'Wider Europe' // Geopolitics. 2011. Vol. 16. No 3; Butler, E. The Geopolitics of Merger and Acquisition in the Central European Energy Market // Geopolitics. 2011. Vol. 16. No 3; Dickel, R., Hassanzadeh, E., Henderson, J. et al Reducing European Dependence on Russian Gas: distinguishing natural gas security from geopolitics. Oxford: OIES, October 2014. OIES Paper. No NG 92; Johnson, C., Derrick, M. A Splintered Heartland: Russia, Europe, and the Geopolitics of Networked Energy Infrastructure // Geopolitics. 2012. Vol. 17. No 3; Kropatcheva, E. Playing Both Ends Against the Middle: Russia's Geopolitical Energy Games with the EU and Ukraine // Geopolitics. 2011. Vol. 16. No. 3; Tarasov, A. The making of empires: Russia's gas-exporting pipelines v Nabucco // Journal of World Energy Law and Business. 2011. Vol. 4. No. 1.

³ Belyi, A. Transnational Gas Markets and the EU-Russia Energy Relations. London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2015; Boussena, S., Locatelli, C. Gas market developments and their effect on relations between Russia and the EU // OPEC Energy Review. 2011. Vol. 35. No 1; Cohen, M.D. Russia and the European Union: An Outlook for Collaboration and Competition in European Natural Gas Markets // Demokratizatsiya. 2007. Vol. 15. Issue. 4. Fall; Correljé, A. van der Linde, C. Energy supply security and geopolitics: A European perspective // Energy Policy. 2006. Vol. 34. No 5; Finon, D., Locatelli, C. Russian and European gas interdependence: Could contractual trade channel geopolitics? // Energy Policy. Vol. 36. No 1; Goldthau, A. Rhetoric versus reality: Russian threats to European energy supply // Energy Policy. 2008. Vol. 36. No 2; Konoplyanik, A.A. Russian gas at European energy market: Why adaptation is inevitable // Energy Strategy Reviews. 2012. No 1; Leal-Arcas, R. The EU and Russia as Energy Trading Partners: Friends or Foes? // European Foreign Affairs Review. 2009, Vol. 14. No 3; Liuhto, K. The Russian oil exports via the Baltic sea – do oil shipments through the EU's inner sea bring Russia closer to the EU or bring them apart? // Journal of Business Economics and Management. 2003. Vol. 4. No 2.

⁴ Belyi, A. 1) EU Missed Role in International Transit Governance // Journal of European Integration. 2012. Vol. 34. No 3; 2) New regime for energy investment reciprocity // Journal for World Energy Law and Business. 2009. Vol. 2. No 2; Belyi, A., Nappert, S., V. Pogoretsky, V. Modernizing the Energy Charter? Road map and Russian Draft Convention on energy security // Journal of Energy and Natural Resource Law. 2011. Vol. 29. No 3; Belyi, A., Klaus, U. Dispute Resolution Mechanisms in Energy Transit - Missed opportunities for Gazprom or false hopes in Europe? // Journal of Energy and Natural Resources Law. 2007. Vol. 25. No 3; Konoplyanik, A.A. 1) A Common

законодательства России и Евросоюза в области энергетики, модальностей этого процесса и его последствия.⁵

Второй, геополитический, исходил из реализма, утверждал, что в силу специфики России или международных отношений в целом выстраивание отношений только на рыночных основах невозможно.⁶ С общей секьюритизацией исследовательской повестки отношений России и Евросоюза, а также растущими опасениями в отношении действий Москвы сдвиг закономерно произошел в сторону геополитики. Особую озабоченность в этой связи вызывали страны т.н. общего соседства, а также связанные с ними транзитные риски.⁷ Внимание зарубежных ученых также было сфокусировано на различиях в интересах стран-членов, способности России манипулировать этими различиями, а также на вариантах решения данной проблемы.⁸

Russia-EU Energy Space: The New EU-Russia Partnership Agreement, Acquis Communautaire and the Energy Charter // *Journal of Energy and Natural Resources Law*. 2009. Vol. 27. № 2, 2) Gas Transit in Eurasia: Transit Issues between Russia and the European Union and the Role of the Energy Charter // *Journal of Energy & Natural Resources Law*. 2009. Vol. 27. No 3; Rocco, A. The Energy Charter Treaty's Failure? The Different Perceptions of Energy Security: within the European Union and beyond its Borders // *Eurolimes*. 2013. Vol. 15. Spring.

⁵ Romanova, T. Legal Approximation in Energy: A New Approach for the European Union and Russia // C. Kuzemko, M. Keating, A. Goldthau, A. Belyi (eds.) *Political Economy in Energy*, Palgrave, 2012; Romanova, T. The Political Economy of EU-Russian Energy Relations // G. Fermann (ed.) *Political Economy of Energy in Europe: Forces of Fragmentation and Integration*. Berliner Wissenschafts-Verlag, 2009.

⁶ Belyi, A. Transnational Gas Markets ... op.cit.; Correljé, A. van der Linde, C. Energy supply security and geopolitics... op. cit.; Finon, D., Locatelli, C. Russian and European gas interdependence... Op.cit.; Kropatcheva E. He who has the pipeline calls the tune? Russia's energy power against the background of the shale "revolutions" // *Energy Policy*. 2014. Vol. 66. March; Le Coq, C., Paltsev, E. Assessing gas transit risks: Russia vs. the EU // *Energy Policy*. 2012. Vol. 42. March; Nowak, Z., Ćwiek-Karpowicz, J., Godzimirski, J. The Power to Influence Europe? Russia's Grand Gas Strategy // *The Polish Institute of International Affairs. Strategic Files*. 2015. March. No. 6 (69); Smith Stegen, K. Deconstructing the "energy weapon": Russia's threat to Europe as case study // *Energy Policy*. 2011. Vol. 39. No 10.

⁷ Chernavsky, S., Eismont, O. How to sell Russian gas to Europe via Ukraine? // *OPEC Energy Review*. 2012. Vol. 36. No 1; De Jong, S., Wouters, J., Sterckx, S. The 2009 Russian-Ukrainian Gas Dispute: Lessons for European Energy Crisis Management after Lisbon // *European Foreign Affairs Review*. 2010. Vol. 15. Pp. 511-538; Gnedina, E., Emerson, M. The Case for a Gas Transit Consortium in Ukraine: A Cost-Benefit Analysis. Brussels: CEPS, January 2009. CEPS Policy Brief. No 180; Godzimirski, J.M. 1) European Energy Security in the Wake of the Russia-Ukraine Crisis // *The Polish Institute of International Affairs. Strategic Files*. 2014. December. No. 27 (63), 2) Energy in the Neighbourhood: Russian and EU Perspectives and Policies // *The Polish Quarterly on International Affairs*. 2014. Vol 23. No. 4; Gromadzki G. Energy game : Ukraine, Moldova and Belarus between the EU and Russia. Warsaw: Stefan Batory found., 2007; Kropatcheva, E. Playing Both Ends Against the Middle... Op.cit.; Newnham, R.E. Pipeline politics: Russian energy sanctions and the 2010 Ukrainian elections // *Journal of Eurasian Studies*. 2013. Vol. 4. Issue 2; Pirani, S., Stern, J., Yafimava, K. The Russo-Ukrainian gas dispute of January 2009: a comprehensive assessment. Oxford: OIES, February 2009. No NG 27; Pirani, S., Stern, J., Yafimava, K. The April 2010 Russo-Ukrainian gas agreement and its implications for Europe. Oxford: OIES, June 2010. No NG 42; Stern, J. The Russian-Ukrainian gas crisis of January 2006. Oxford: OIES, 16 January 2006; Tsakiris, T. Dependencies & Vulnerabilities: The Energy Parameters of the Evolving Crisis between Russia, the EU and Ukraine. Athens: ELIAMEP, April 2014.

⁸ Barrette, P. La securite d'approvisionnement en gaz de l'Union europeenne: vers une strategie commune a l'egard de la Russie? // *Etudes internationales*. 2011. Vol. 42. No 2; Grigas, A. The Gas Relationship between the Baltic States and Russia: politics and commercial realities. Oxford: OIES, October 2012. No NG 67; Hirman, K. The Energy Security of the SR in the Context of the EU and Relations with Russia // *International Issues & Slovak Foreign Policy Affairs*. 2009. Vol. XVIII. No. 1; Mauraing, L., Schaer, D. The Effects of the Russian Energy Sector on the Security of the Baltic States // *Baltic Security & Defence Review*. 2006. Vol. 8. No 1; Molis, A. Transforming EU-Russia energy relations: the Baltic States' vision // *Lithuanian Foreign Policy Review*. 2011; Noël, P. 1) A Market Between us: Reducing the Political Cost of Europe's Dependence on Russian Gas. Cambridge:

Исследовались также предпосылки различий во взглядах России и Евросоюза на энергетическое сотрудничество. Причем в данном случае применялся богатый спектр различных теоретико-методологических подходов.⁹ Ряд российских исследователей также публиковали работы, направленные на разъяснение позиции России,¹⁰ представление мотивации энергетических компаний и официальных властей.

За рубежом присутствовали и исследования более эмпирического характера, посвященные тому, как изменения в законодательстве и политике повлияют на поставки из России в ЕС. При этом если в нашей стране фокус был на изменениях в Евросоюзе,¹¹ то

University of Cambridge, 2009. EPRG Working Paper. No 0916; 2) Beyond Dependence: How to Deal with Russian Gas. London: ECFR, November 2008. Policy brief; Wyciszkievicz, E. Polish Perspective on the EU's Energy Policy and the Security of External Supply // *International Issues & Slovak Foreign Policy Affairs*. 2009. Vol. XVIII. No. 1; Whist, B.S. Nord Stream: Not Just a Pipeline. An analysis of the political debates in the Baltic Sea region regarding the planned gas pipeline from Russia to Germany. Oslo: Fridtjof Nansen Institute, 2008. FNI Report. No 15/2008.

⁹ Boussena, S., Locatelli, C. Energy institutional and organisational changes in EU and Russia: Revisiting gas relations // *Energy Policy*. 2013. Vol. 55, April; Egenhofer, C., Grigoriev, L., Socor, V., Riley, A. European Energy Security What Should It Mean? What To Do? Brussels: CEPS, IISS, DCAF, October 2006. ESF Working Paper. No 23; Godzimirski, J.M. Mapping EU countries' relationships with energy suppliers. GREEN European Policybrief. Global Re-Ordering: Evolution Through European Networks, March 2014; Hadfield, A. EU–Russia Energy Relations: Aggregation and Aggravation // *Journal of Contemporary European Studies*. 2008. Vol. 16. No 2; Khasson, V. Discourses and Interests in EU-Russia Energy Relations. Leuven: Leuven K.U., 2006. Chair InBev – Baillet Latour Working Papers. No. 35; Kratochvíl, P., Tichý, L. EU and Russian discourse on energy relations // *Energy Policy*. 2013. Vol. 56, May; Neuman, M. EU–Russian Energy Relations after the 2004/2007 EU Enlargement: An EU Perspective // *Journal of Contemporary European Studies*. 2010. Vol. 18. No 3; Kuzemko, C. Ideas, power and change: explaining EU–Russia energy relations // *Journal of European Public Policy*. 2014. Vol. 21. No 1; Milov, V. The EU-Russia Energy Dialogue: Competition Versus Monopolies. Paris: IFRI, February 2006. *Russie.Nei.Visions*. No 13.

¹⁰ Belyi, A. 1) Institutional trends in Russia's oil and gas sectors // *Journal of World Energy Law and Business*. 2013. Vol. 6. No 3; 2) Belyi, A. Russia's gas export reorientation from West to East: economic and political considerations // *Journal of World Energy Law and Business*. 2015. Vol. 8. No 1; 3) Belyi, A. Russia's gas policies in light of new realities // *European Energy Journal*. 2013. Vol. 3. No 3; Belyi, A., Goldthau, A. Between a rock and a hard place: international market dynamics, domestic politics and Gazprom's strategy. Working Paper for Florence School of Regulation, RSCAS: 2015/22; Belyi, A., Overland, I., Vishnyakova, A. New paradigms for Post RAO UES energy paradigm // *Journal for World Energy Law and Business*. 2011. Vol. 4. No 2; Kaveshnikov, N., The issue of energy security in relations between Russia and the European Union // *European Security*. 2010. Vol. 19. № 4; Romanova, T. The Russian Perspective on the Energy Dialogue // *Journal of Contemporary European Studies*. 2008. Vol. 16. № 2.

¹¹ Baev, P., Bartuska, V., Cleutinx, C., Gaddy, C. et al Pipelines, Politics and Power. The future of EU-Russia energy relations. London: CER, 2008; Belyi, A. 1) EU-Russia energy dialogue : towards a decline or a new breath? // *Revue de l'Énergie*. 2006. No 570, 2) New Dimensions of the EU Energy Security and their impact on relations with Russia // *Journal for European Integration*. 2003. Vol. 25. No 4; Böhme, D. EU-Russia Energy Relations: What Chance for Solutions? A Focus on the Natural Gas Sector. Potsdam: Universitätsverlag Potsdam, 2011; Gilbert, S. Gas Politics between Russia and the EU // *Journal of Politics & International Affairs*. 2009. Spring; Gotz, R. Russian Gas and European Energy Security. Berlin: SWP, 2010. SWP Research Paper. No 10; Grabham, B., Rauzy, B., Feygin, V. Addressing the Impact of the Financial Crisis on EU - Russia Energy Cooperation. Final Report. European Commission, 2009. Project No. 2009/205704 - Version 2; Hazakis, K., Proedrou, F. EU-Russia Energy Diplomacy: The Need for an Active Strategic Partnership. Brugge: College of Europe, 2012. EU Diplomacy Papers. No 4/2012; Johnson, D. 1) EU–Russian Energy Links: A Marriage of Convenience? // *Government and Opposition*. 2005. Vol. 40. No. 2, 2) EU-Russian Energy Policy – Single or Multiple Policy Paradigms? // *Energy & Environment*. 2004. Vol. 15. No 3; Finon, D., Locatelli, C. The liberalisation of the European gas market and its consequences for Russia. Grenoble: IEPE, 2002; Milov, V. Russia and the West. The Energy Factor. Paris / Washington: IFRI, CSIS, July 2008; Morgado Dos Santos, A.M. Op.cit.; Liuhto, K. (ed.) The EU-Russia gas connection: Pipes, politics and problems. Turku: Pan-European Institute, 2009. Electronic Publications of Pan-European Institute. No 8/2009; Perspectives on EU-Russia relations /ed. by Debra Johnson a. Paul Robinson. - London New York : Routledge, 2005; Sherr, J. The Russia–EU Energy Relationship: Getting it Right // *The*

за рубежом одинаково пристально следили и за изменениями в Евросоюзе (в особенности, за антиконкурентным расследованием против Газпрома,¹² за изменением в характере ценообразования¹³), и за трансформациями в Москве (в т.ч. за стратегиями официальных властей и российских компаний).¹⁴ Исследовались и модальности Энергетического диалога.¹⁵

Особой привлекательностью также пользовалось изучение различных способов обойти территорию России при транспортировке газовых ресурсов, особенно из Каспийского региона, в т.ч. через территорию Турции.¹⁶

International Spectator: Italian Journal of International Affairs. 2010. Vol. 45. No 2; Talseth, L.-C. U. The EU-Russia Energy Dialogue. Travelling Without Moving. Berlin: SWP, 2012. SWP Research Paper. No 5; Yegorov, Y., Franz Wirl, F. Energy relations between Russia and EU with emphasis on natural gas // OPEC Energy Review. 2008. December.

¹² Maican, O.-H. Some Legal Aspects of Energy Security in the Relations Between EU and Russia // Romanian Journal of European Affairs. 2009. Vol. 9. No. 4; Morris, P.S. Iron Curtain at the border: Gazprom and the Russian blocking order to prevent the extraterritoriality of EU competition law // European Competition Law Review. 2014. Vol. 35. No 12; Riley, A. Commission v. Gazprom: The antitrust clash of the decade? Brussels: CEPS, 31 October 2012. CEPS Policy Brief. No. 285; Sartori, N. The European Commission vs. Gazprom: An Issue of Fair Competition or a Foreign Policy Quarrel? Rome: IAI, January 2013. IAI Working Papers. No 13 / 03.

¹³ Stern, J., Rogers, H. The Transition to Hub-Based Pricing in Continental Europe: A Response to Sergei Komlev of Gazprom Export. Oxford: OIES, February 2013. Oxford Energy Comment.

¹⁴ Baev, P. From European to Eurasian energy security: Russia needs and energy Perestroika // Journal of Eurasian Studies. 2012. Vol. 3. No 2; Ćwiek-Karpowicz, J. 1) Russian Energy Policy Towards the European Union in the Context of the Economic Crisis // The Polish Quarterly of International Affairs. 2011. No 1, 2) Russia's Gas Sector: In Need of Liberalization in the Context of the Shale Gas Revolution and Energy Relations with the European Union // Journal of East-West Business. 2012. Vol. 18. No 1; Guillet, J. Gazprom, partenaire prévisible: relire les crises energetiques Russie – Ukraine et Russie – Belarus. Paris: IFRI, Mars 2007. Russie.Nei.Visions. No 18; Feklyunina, V. The 'Great Diversification Game': Russia's Vision of the European Union's Energy Projects in the Shared Neighbourhood // Journal of Contemporary European Research. 2008. Vol. 4. No. 2; Havlik, P. European Energy Security in View of Russian Economic and Integration Prospects. Vienna: Institute for International Economic Studies (WIIW), May 2010. Research Reports. No 362; Heinrich, A. Under the Kremlin's Thumb: Does Increased State Control in the Russian Gas Sector Endanger European Energy Security? // Europe-Asia Studies. 2008. Vol. 60. No 9; Locatelli, C. Gazprom's export strategies under the institutional constraint of the Russian gas market // OPEC Energy Review. 2008. September; Lund Sagen, E., Tsygankova, M. Russian natural gas exports— Will Russian gas price reforms improve the European security of supply? // Energy Policy. 2008. Vol. 36. No 2; Price, R.F. Energy Reform in Russia and the Implications for European Energy Security // Demokratizatsiya. 2007. Vol. 15. No 4; Riley, A. The Coming of the Russian Gas Deficit: Consequences and Solutions. Brussels: CEPS, October 2006. CEPS Policy Brief. No. 116; Spanjer, A. Russian gas price reform and the EU–Russia gas relationship: Incentives, consequences and European security of supply // Energy Policy. 2007. Vol. 35. No 5; Van Der Meulen, E. F. Gas Supply and EU–Russia Relations // Europe-Asia Studies. 2009. Vol. 61. No. 5.

¹⁵ Aalto, P. From Separate Policies to Dialogue? Natural Gas, Oil and Electricity on the Future Agenda of EU-Russia Energy Relations. Tartu: CEURUS, March 2012. No 3; Bousset, S., Locatelli, C. Energy institutional and organisational changes in EU and Russia... Op.cit.; Romanova T. 1) Energy Dialogue from Strategic Partnership to the Regional Level of the Northern Dimension // The EU— Russia Energy Dialogue: Securing Europe 's Future Energy Supplies? P. Aalto (ed.) Ashgate, 2007; 2) Russian energy in the EU market: Bolstered institutions and their effects // Energy Policy. 2014. Vol. 74. November.

¹⁶ Baev, P. Energy Intrigues on the EU's Southern Flank: Applying Game Theory // Problems of Post-Communism. 2010. May/June. Vol. 57. No 3; Baev, P.K., Øverland, I. The South Stream versus Nabucco pipeline race: geopolitical and economic (ir)rationalities and political stakes in mega-projects // International Affairs. 2010. Vol. 86. No 5; Erdogdu, E. Bypassing Russia: Nabucco project and its implications for the European gas security // Renewable & Sustainable Energy Reviews. 2010. Vol. 14. No 9; Ermida, G., Fernandes, J. P. The European Union's Strategic Gas Supply Options and the Prevalence of the Southern Corridor // European Foreign Affairs Review. 2013. Vol. 18. No 4; Finon, D. The EU foreign gas policy of transit corridors: autopsy of the stillborn Nabucco project // OPEC Energy Review. 2011. Vol. 35. No 1; Locatelli, C. Russian and Caspian Hydrocarbons: Energy Supply Stakes for the European Union // Europe-Asia Studies. 2010. Vol. 62. No 6; Pardo Sierra, O. A corridor

Наконец, отметим, что в отличие от России, присутствовали в зарубежной литературе и исследования вопросов энергоэффективности, возобновляемых источников энергии, снижения парниковых газов как сфер сотрудничества Москвы и Брюсселя. Однако внимание им уделялось мало, де-факто, по остаточному принципу.¹⁷

through thorns: EU energy security and the Southern Energy Corridor // *European Security*. 2010. Vol. 19. No 4; Pirani, S., Stern, J., Yafimava, K. Does the cancellation of South Stream signal a fundamental reorientation of Russian gas export policy? Oxford: OIES, January 2015. Oxford Energy Comment; Tekin, A., Williams, P.A. EU–Russian Relations and Turkey's Role as an Energy Corridor // *Europe-Asia Studies*. 2009. Vol. 61. No. 2; Ziegler, C.E. Energy Pipeline Networks and Trust: The European Union and Russia in Comparative Perspective // *International Relations*. 2013. Vol. 27. No 1.

¹⁷ Boute, A. 1) A comparative analysis of the European and Russian support schemes for renewable energy: return on European experience for Russia // *Journal of World Energy Law and Business*. 2011. Vol. 4. No. 2; 2) Energy Efficiency as a New Paradigm of the European External Energy Policy: The Case of the EU–Russian Energy Dialogue // *Europe-Asia Studies*. 2013. Vol. 65. No 6, 3) Boute, A. Improving the Climate for European Investments in the Russian Electricity Production Sector: (II) the Role of Regulatory Convergence // *Journal of Energy & Natural Resources Law*. 2008. Vol. 26. No 3; Boute A., Willems, P. RUSTEC: Greening Europe's energy supply by developing Russia's renewable energy potential // *Energy Policy*. 2012. Vol. 51. December; Jefferson Institute Improving Energy Relations With Russia: the Roles of Energy Efficiency and Alternative Energy. Washington: Jefferson Institute, 2009; Kononenko, V. Russia-EU cooperation on energy efficiency. Enthusiasm and Challenges Ahead. Helsinki: FIIA, 16 November 2010. FIIA Briefing Paper. No 68; Laroui, F., Tellegen, E., Tourilova, K. Joint implementation in energy between the EU and Russia Out look and potential // *Energy Policy*. 2004. Vol. 32. No 7; Lund, P.D. Energy Efficiency, Renewable Energy and Energy Innovations As a Strategic Resource and Partnership for EU and Russia. Turku: Energy Challenges in Northern Europe, November 2008; Sharples, J.D. Russian approaches to energy security and climate change: Russian gas exports to the EU // *Environmental Politics* Volume 22, Issue 4, 2013.